Disposition of Comments on ISO/IEC FCD 18024-4

Table of Contents

- Recommendation
- Japan
- United Kingdom
- United States
- SEDRIS

Recommendation

The editing meeting recommends unanimously that ISO/IEC 18024-4 progress to FDIS.

Japan

The national body of Japan disapproves FCD 18024-4 (SEDRIS language binding to C) for reason as below. Acceptance of these reasons and appropriate changes in the text will change our vote to approval.

JAPAN_T001) This document should be changed according to the changes in FCD 18023-1.

RESPONSE: Accept.
UK National Body Comments on

SEDRIS Binding to C

Final Committee Draft ISO/IEC 18024-4

(ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 24 N2593)

(ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 24 WG 8 N0365)

The UK votes to APPROVE FCD 18024-4, subject to the following comments being satisfied.

General

**UK.G001:**
Entire document
The functionality should be updated to conform to the FDIS text of ISO/IEC 18023-1.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**UK.G002:**
Copyright notice
The copyright notice frame should be formatted to use only a single line of text.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**UK.G003:**
Throughout
References to “ISO/IEC 18023-1” should be references to Part 1 of “ISO/IEC 18023”.

**RESPONSE:** The reference will be to “Part 1 of ISO/IEC 18023”.

**UK.G004:**
Throughout
All “table of contents” tables at the beginning of the clauses and annex should be renamed “Topics” as ISO standards may only have one optional overall table of contents.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**UK.G005:**
Throughout
All references to “this International Standard” should be references to “this part of ISO/IEC 18024”.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**UK.G006:**
Throughout
The hyperlinks at the bottom of each HTML page actually link to ISO/IEC 18023-2. They should all be changed to the appropriate link.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Technical

4—Tables

UK_T001:
Table 4.5
Either Table 4.4 is missing, or this table should be renumbered as Table 4.4.

RESPONSE: The tables will be sequentially numbered.

5—Definition of fundamental data types

UK_T002:
Table 5.1
This table should be layout out in two columns for ease of navigation.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Annex A—Data types in compilation order and external functions

UK_T003:
Throughout
The technical contents of this annex should be compiled successfully before the submission of FDIS text.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Editorial

5—Definition of fundamental data types

UK_E001:
5.1.2
The reference to “The SEDRIS standard, ISO/IEC 18023-1” should be changed to “Part 1 of ISO/IEC 18023”.

RESPONSE: Accept.

UK_E002:
5.2
The mismatch between the table of contents numbering and the numbering of the subclauses should be corrected.

RESPONSE: Accept.
United States


The US votes to approve ISO/IEC FCD 18024-4, Information technology - Synthetic Environment Data Representation and Interchange Specification (SEDRIS) - Language bindings - Part 4: C with the following comments:

GENERAL

US_G001:
At the beginning of all clauses after Clause 2, the “table of contents” should be called “Topics”

RESPONSE: Accept.

TECHNICAL

Clause 3

US_T001:

Sub Clause 3.7 Identifiers for graphical items

Problem: Are the new items those introduced by registration? If so should be made clearer.

Recommendation: This clause should be rewritten. In as much as the registration of new selection item data types will also register a label.

RESPONSE: Accept.

EDITORIAL

index.html

US_E001:

index.html

the 1st sentence cites an incorrect “full title” for the standard. Change “— C” to read “— Part 4: C”. The full title is shown correctly at the top of the Scope clause.
RESPONSE:  Accept.

US_E002:

index.html

In the table of contents, clause 5 is titled “Type definitions”, however the actual title is shown in clause 5 as “Definition of fundamental data types”. Correct where appropriate for consistency.

RESPONSE:  The index will use the Clause 5 title.

US_E003:

index.html

the last paragraph states that “There are several annexes included in this International Standard”, however there is only one annex provided.

RESPONSE:  The text will be corrected to be: “The following annex is included in this part of ISO/IEC 18024:”.

Introduction

US_E004:

Introduction

In the 2nd sentence, change “application programmer interface” to read “application program interface”, as per clause 7 of ISO/IEC 18023-1.

RESPONSE:  Accept.

Clause 1

US_E005:

Clause 1 Scope

Verify whether the “1 Scope” heading should be centered on the page, as are the headings of all other clauses.

RESPONSE:  The “1 Scope” heading will be left-justified. The title of the standard will remain centred.

US_E006:

Clause 1 Scope

In the 1st sentence, change “application programmer interface” to read “application program interface”, as per clause 7 of ISO/IEC 18023-1.

RESPONSE:  Accept.

Clause 2
US_E007:
Clause 2. Normative references
For I18041-4, change “— C” to read “— Part 4: C”, as per the Scope clause of ISO/IEC 18041-4.

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E008:
Clause 2. Normative references
For I18042-4, change “— C” to read “— Part 4: C”, as per the Scope clause of ISO/IEC 18042-4.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Clause 3

US_E009:
Clause 3
In the footnote for this clause, spell out the NGA acronym, and provide a hyperlink to the NGA web site for additional information.

RESPONSE: Accept. NGA will be expanded to “National Geospatial-Intelligence Agency”.

US_E010:
Clause 3 Abbreviation table.
The word “color” is spelled using US English and should be spelled using international English.

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E011:
Sub Clause 3.2
In the 1st sentence, change “application programmer interface” to read “application program interface”, as per clause 7 of ISO/IEC 18023-1.

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E012:
Sub Clause 3.9
The first sentence references 5 Type definitions, however the actual title is shown in clause 5 as “Definition of fundamental data types”. Correct where appropriate for consistency.

RESPONSE: The reference to clause 5 will use the clause 5 name.

US_E013:
Sub Clause 3.10.2
In the 3rd paragraph, 2nd sentence, change “… a pointer to a pointer to the structure which defines …” to read either “… a pointer to a pointer to the structure, which defines …” (add a comma) or “… a pointer to a pointer to the structure that defines …” (change “which” to read “that”).

RESPONSE: The word “which” will be changed to “that”.

Page 6
US_E014:
Sub Clause 3.10.2
In the 4th paragraph, 1st sentence, change “… to a subsequent function which returns …” to read either “… to a subsequent function, which returns …” (add a comma) or “… to a subsequent function that returns …” (change “which” to read “that”).

RESPONSE: The word “which” will be changed to “that”.

US_E015:
Sub Clause 3.10.2
In the 4th paragraph, 4th sentence, change “… pointers which may have …” to read either “… pointers, which may have …” (add a comma) or “… pointers that may have …” (change “which” to read “that”).

RESPONSE: The word “which” will be changed to “that”.

US_E016:
Sub Clause 3.10.2
In the 5th paragraph, 1st sentence, the hyperlink to 3.11.3 C-specific SEDRIS status codes is inoperative.

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E017:
Sub Clause 3.10.2
In the 5th paragraph, 3rd sentence, change “Whenever, an error occurs …” to read “Whenever an error occurs …” (delete the comma).

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E018:
Sub Clause 3.11.1
In the 2nd sentence, change “Errors status values …” to read “Error status values …” (make “Errors” singular).

RESPONSE: Accept.

Clause 4
US_E019:
Sub Clause 4.2.1
In the 2nd paragraph, subparagraphs a and b end in semicolons (;), whereas subparagraphs c – f end in periods (.). Correct the punctuation as appropriate.

RESPONSE: All items except the last will end in a semi-colon. The last item (f) will be merged into the preceding items as appropriate.

US_E020:
Sub Clause 4.2.1
Abbreviation policy in construction of identifiers, 2nd item c
“refinements are” should be “refinement is”
RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E021: Sub Clause 4.2.2
The grammar rules for using the words “which” vs. “that” are: “X, which Y” or “X that Y”. Accordingly, in all 3 sentences, change “which” to read “that”.

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E022: Table 4.2 -- The font size of the abbreviations appearing in the Abbreviation column are too small to read. Enlarge the font size used.

RESPONSE: The font size will be allowed to be no smaller than 90% of the normal size.

US_E023: Sub Clause 4.3.2
In the first sentence, provide a hyperlink to ISO/IEC 18023-1 Clause 2.

RESPONSE: The reference will be corrected.

US_E024: Sub Clause 4.3.3
In the first sentence, provide a hyperlink to ISO/IEC 18023-1 Clause 2.

RESPONSE: The reference will be corrected.

Clause 5

US_E025: Clause 5.
Definition of fundamental data types -- Verify whether the “5. Definition of fundamental data types” heading should be centered on the page, as are the headings of all other clauses.

RESPONSE: The heading will be left-justified.

US_E026: Sub Clause 5.1.2
In the first sentence, provide a hyperlink to ISO/IEC 18023-1 Clause 2.

RESPONSE: The reference will be corrected.

US_E027: Sub Clause 5.2
For all occurrences for Selection data types replace “# define” with “# define &nbsp;”

RESPONSE: The text “#define&nbsp;” will be used.

US_E028: Sub Clause 5.2.2
There are 2 subclauses that are assigned this subclause number; "Integer data
types” and “Floating point data types”. Change the 2\textsuperscript{nd} occurrence to read “5.2.3 Floating point data types”, and renumber all subsequent 5.2.x subclauses.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**US_E029:**
Sub Clause 5.2.5
Selection data types -- In the 1\textsuperscript{st} sentence, use the Courier font for “SE\_Short\_Integer” for emphasis.

**RESPONSE:** SE\_Short\_Integer will be formatted in code style.

**US_E030:**
Sub Clause 5.2.6
Set data types -- In the 1\textsuperscript{st} sentence, use the Courier font for “SE\_Integer” for emphasis.

**RESPONSE:** SE\_Integer will be formatted in code style.

**US_E031:**
Sub Clause 5.3.2
In the 2\textsuperscript{nd} sentence, use the Courier font for “SE\_Float” for emphasis.

**RESPONSE:** SE\_Float will be formatted in code style.

**US_E032:**
Sub Clause 5.3.2
Next to last sentence, change “… array types which are required …” to read “… array types that are required …”.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**US_E033:**
Sub Clause 5.3.3
In the 1\textsuperscript{st} paragraph, last sentence, change “… the first index is referred is called the length …” to read “… the first index is called the length …” (delete the phrase “referred is”).

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**US_E034:**
Sub Clause 5.3.3
In the 2\textsuperscript{nd} paragraph, change “… the structures which form …” to read “… the structures that form …”.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**US_E035:**
Sub Clause 5.3.3
In the 2\textsuperscript{nd} paragraph, something appears to be missing from the end of the 2\textsuperscript{nd} sentence. It appears to end prematurely as: The suffix is of form “.

**RESPONSE:** The form should be “\_nD” where n is the dimensionality of the array.’
**US_E036:**
Sub Clause 5.3.3
In the 3rd paragraph, change “… types which are required …” to read “… types that are required …”.

**RESPONSE:** Accept. Also, change “of data type fields” to “or data type fields”

Clause 6

**US_E037:**
Sub Clause 6.1.2

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**US_E038:**
Sub Clause 6.2
Clarify the meaning of the sentence “The following functions provide comprise the SEDRIS application program interface.” (see the underlined words). The word “provide” should be removed.

**RESPONSE:** See response to SEDRIS_T020.

**SEDRIS**

**SEDRIS Organization Comments**

On

**Final Committee DRAFT ISO/IEC 18024-4**

18 December 2004

**GENERAL**

**SEDRIS_G001:** Index

The title of the Index file should be changed from “EDCS frames test” to “ISO/IEC 18024-4—SEDRIS Binding to C”

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**SEDRIS_G002:** Throughout

Replace “application programmer interface” with “application program interface” (see Introduction and 1 Scope).
RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_G003: Throughout

The word SEDRIS should be removed from all phrases such as “SEDRIS transmittal”, “SEDRIS API”, etc., except in 1 Scope.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_G004: Each file

The titles used in each file except the scope should be made consistent.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_G005: Throughout

The tables of content at the beginning of each clause and annex should be called “Topics”.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_G006: Throughout

References to this specification should all be changed to “this part of ISO/IEC 18024”.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_G007: Throughout

The entire document should be made consistent with the next draft of ISO/IEC 18023-1.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_G008: Throughout

The titles of the various clauses and/or annexes are inconstantly layed out. They should either be all centered or all left-justified.

RESPONSE: The clause titles will all be left-justified.

TECHNICAL

Index

SEDRIS_T001: full title

“C” should be “Part 4: C”.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Foreword

SEDRIS_T002: Boilerplate text
The text should be updated to the latest form required by ITTF.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**Introduction**

**SEDRIS_T003:** 1st paragraph

The text should be aligned with the phraseology used in ISO/IEC 18023-1.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**Clause 2**

**SEDRIS_T004:** Hyperlinks

The hyperlinks should be applied to the organization name and/or title as required by ITTF.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**Clause 3**

**SEDRIS_T005:** 3.2 Conformance, 2nd paragraph

The references to EDCS and SRM should be to the standards.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**SEDRIS_T006:** 3.3, 3rd sentence

The text “replace the error handling function” should be “replace functions that correspond to the function data types”.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**SEDRIS_T007:** 3.7, heading

The name should be changed to “Identifiers for registered items”.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**SEDRIS_T008:** 3.7, 1st paragraph, 2nd sentence

The phrase “These data types” should be “Registration”.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**SEDRIS_T009:** 3.7, 1st paragraph, 3rd sentence

This sentence should be replaced by “These new values are referenced by identifiers specified as part of the registration.”

**RESPONSE:** Accept.
SEDRI_T010: 3.7, 1st paragraph, 4th sentence

This text should be removed as it does not apply to registered items in SEDRIS.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRI_T011: 3.7, 2nd paragraph

So that unregistered items can be easily recognized, this paragraph should be changed to:

“The format of the identifiers for new values of selection and set date type values is:

“SE_datatypeprefix_Un”

where:

datatypeprefix is the set of characters used for normative value names of this data type.
“U” indicates unregistered.
n is the absolute value of the item number to be used for the unregistered value.”

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRI_T012: 3.7, Example

The example should only show an example for an unregistered image mapping method.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRI_T013: 3.8

The following text should be appended: “The function data types define functions that return other data types.”

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRI_T014: 3.10.2, 5th paragraph

The reference should be to 3.11.2.

RESPONSE: Accept and the hyperlink will be repaired.

SEDRI_T015: 3.11.1

The data type “SE_StatusCode” should be “SE_Return_Code”.

Add the following additional text after the first sentence: “Further information about a FAILURE return is provided by using the function SE_GetLastFunctionStatus which returns a value of type SE_Status_Code.”

In the last sentence, “Errors status values defined in ISO/IEC 18023-1 (see I18023-1])” should be “SE_Status_Code” value defined in part 1 of ISO/IEC 18023-1”

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRI_T016: 3.11.2, Table 3.2
The table should also include the codes for the selectors. Also, the heading for the 1st column should be changed to “Selector”.

**RESPONSE:** Accept. Also, a new column will be added after the 1st column which adds the code of the selector.

Clause 4

**SEDRIS_T017:** Table 4.4

Either Table 4.5 should be numbered to Table 4.4, or there is a missing table.

**RESPONSE:** The tables will be sequentially numbered.

Clause 5

**SEDRIS_T018:** Title

The title of this clause is different from that specified in the Index. The title should be consistent throughout.

**RESPONSE:** The index will be corrected to use the title of Clause 5.

Clause 6

**SEDRIS_T019:** 6.1.2, template

The portion of the template displaying comments should be removed as no functions specifications have comments. Also, the last paragraph should be removed.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**SEDRIS_T020:** 6.2, 1st sentence

This sentence make so sense. It should be replaced by “The following functions comprise the API.”.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

**EDITORIAL**

Index

**SEDRIS_E001:** List of annexes

“Compilation order” should be the text shown in the table.

**RESPONSE:** Accept.

Clause 4

**SEDRIS_E002:** 4.1.1

The reference to ISO/IEC 18023-1 should be hyperlinked to Clause 2.
**RESPONSE:** The text “ISO/IEC 18023-1” will be changed to “Part 1 of ISO/IEC 18023” and hyperlinked to the appropriate entry in Clause 2.